29. 12. 2025

09 | 419/7

To
Evaluation Board
Agency for Quality in the Higher Education

EXTERNAL ASSESSMENT REPORT BY EXTERNAL ASSESSMENT BODY

BASIC DATA	
Name of the institution	International Vision University, Faculty of Law, Gostivar
Location	Gostivar, North Macedonia
Members of the expert committee (name and surname, official contact information)	1.Akad,Vlado Kambovski, Macedonian academy of sciences and arts, member of Evaluation Board 2. Janis Grasis, professor of Riga Stradins Univesity, Riga, Latvia. E-mail: janis.grasis@rsu.lv 3. Dalibor Dolezal, University of Zagreb, Faculty of Education and Rehabilitation Sciences, Department of Criminology; dalibor.dolezal@erf.unizg.hr
Period of the visit to the higher education institution	15.-16.12.2025
Grounds for the External Assessment	▢ ▢ Annual plan ▢ ▢ Request of the higher education institution ▢ ▢ Request of the National Council for Higher Education and Scientific Research X Request of the Minister responsible for higher education
Decision on the establishment of the expert committee (decision number and date)	No. 09-495/2 from 21.07.2025 09-495/2-1 from 17.11.2025

Evaluation on standards and indicators completion

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
STANDARD 1: INSTITUTIONAL POLICIES FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE				
The institution has a quality assurance policy that is published and publicly available.	X			Vision International University (hereinafter referred to as the University) demonstrates its full commitment to quality assurance through the application of formal and informal mechanisms in its activities. The institution has presented the necessary quality assurance documents provided in the annexes.
The institution has an efficient and logical system for ensuring the quality of education. It uses various tools for assessing and improving the quality of education and regularly conducts an evaluation that covers the subjects, teaching staff, the work of support/student services and the general level of satisfaction during the studies. The activities are carried out on the basis of a determined calendar of activities. The management of the institution is committed to the development and improvement of the quality of education. There is a culture of coordination and cooperation between the parties concerned in the process. The institution encourages and ensures the involvement of students, employers and other relevant institutions/organizations in the process.	X	X		Before each academic year, the University prepares an Annual Academic Calendar of Quality Assurance Activities, prepared by the Quality Assurance Center in cooperation with the Vice-Rectors and Deans and approved by the Rector of the University, which defines the activities, the bearers of the activities, the participants, the forms - survey questionnaires, the conditions for implementation, analysis and preparation of the results of the implemented activities. (Annex 1.2.I.). The system includes regular evaluation of the study programs, teaching staff, student services and overall student satisfaction, as well as mechanisms for continuous quality improvement. Since 2015, the Faculty of Law has adopted a Regulation on the establishment of a Public Trust Committee, which provides recommendations (opinions) on study programs and other issues of interest to the Faculty. Students are involved in the development and improvement of the quality of education in several ways: through a representative of the University Student Assembly in the organs and bodies of the university (Appendix 1.3.G.) and through the preparation of a Report on Student Surveys (Appendix 1.3.G.). The institution promotes cooperation between management, academic staff, students, employers and other stakeholders in the quality assurance process. Discussions with staff and students have shown that students are offered various opportunities to participate in fairs, internships and other activities that support their broader learning experience. Mechanisms for involving students, employers and other stakeholders in quality-related decision-making require further development to ensure their robust, systematic and transparent operation. There is a need for clearer documentation and communication of the results resulting from stakeholder engagement activities.
A separate body responsible for the development and implementation of the quality assurance policy operates within the institution.		X		. Within the University, a separate body responsible for the development and implementation of the quality assurance policy operates - the Quality Assurance Center. The main goals and tasks of the Quality Assurance Center are to contribute to the development and improvement of quality in teaching and learning; development and improvement of the quality of curricula; improvement and modernization of study programs; etc. More intensive activity of the Department is needed, which would include control of the quality of self-evaluation instruments and their implementation and the implementation of recommendations for improving the quality of teaching and other activities of professors and students.

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The institution regularly analyzes the information arising from the quality assurance system, including statistical information, and takes measures to improve the study programs based on that information. The self-evaluation report is published on the institution's website.		X		In the last five years (including the academic year 2023/2024), three self-evaluations of the University have been conducted at intervals of up to three years. The self-evaluation reports are publicly available on the University's website. However, the scope of data in the reports does not provide all the key statistical indicators expected under the Regulations on Standards and Procedures for External Evaluation and Self-Evaluation of the National Council for Higher Education and Research. The absence of these data sets limits the institution's ability to systematically assess program performance and take informed measures for improvement.
Quality assurance in the institution is a continuous process that does not end with the External Assessment Report or with the further monitoring of the institution. The recommendations from the previous external assessment have been implemented. The progress achieved since the last external assessment has been clearly demonstrated[1]	x			N/A – no previous external evaluation in this institution

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 2: DESIGN AND APPROVAL OF RPOGRAMMES				
INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The institution has adopted an act/s or rules regulating the procedure for the development and approval of study programs for the first, second and third cycle of studies (if applicable).	X			The institution has established documentation for the development and approval of first and second cycle study programmes, including a policy and procedures for curriculum design, as well as a procedure for improving the quality of study programmes, where the procedures and key actors are defined: companies, alumni, advisory board and faculty bodies (Annex 2.1.B.). These documents are embedded in practice, but further improvement is needed to ensure consistency and accountability, clearer structures, documented timelines and transparent communication with stakeholders. The advisory board has an important role in overseeing the development of programmes and should therefore take a more proactive stance in leading, coordinating and monitoring these activities. Study programmes are reviewed and revised in accordance with the same formal procedures and national quality assurance requirements.

---

[1] This indicator will be subject to assessment after the completion of the first External Assessment, i.e. during the next External Assessment of the institution.

The content of the study programs offered at the institution is well designed and described. It is relevant to the purpose of the program and the achievement of learning outcomes. The objectives of the subjects are defined and aligned with the outcome of the educational process (learning outcome). The study programs are designed with the aim of uninterrupted student development and enable students to acquire academic knowledge and skills, including those that can be transferred, which means that they can influence their personal development and can be applied in the development of their future professions.	X		The study programs in law studies - First degree and Postgraduate studies offered at the institution are well aligned horizontally and vertically, enabling students to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills. Graduates are able to enter the labor market and the application of law in various institutions. The learning outcomes intended for students from both study programs are comparable to those of other law faculties in the country and abroad, with which the University cooperates. The documentation reviewed during the evaluation provides a coherent overview of the program objectives, course assignments and the overall structure designed to support the academic and professional development of students. The learning outcomes are coherently linked to the curriculum structure, ECTS allocation, teaching and assessment methods and professional requirements. The studies are conducted in 3 languages. The study programs are designed with defined expected learning outcomes, aligned with the national qualifications framework and the appropriate cycle level. The literature tables for the first and second cycles show outdated sources of literature in some subjects, which necessitates its innovation. It is also necessary that all textbooks published in Turkish be translated at least into English, and preferably into Macedonian, and that the library collection be enriched with contemporary literature in the three languages.
The study programs respond to the development needs of society and the economy.	X		The study programs of the Faculty are created in accordance with continuous monitoring and analysis of the contemporary needs of the society and economy of the Republic of North Macedonia. They are based on the findings of the reports of the State Statistical Office of the Republic of North Macedonia, the reports of the Employment Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia, the employment competitions of the Employment Agency of the Republic of North Macedonia, etc. Students and external stakeholders are systematically involved in the design and approval of the study programs through a formally established Committee for Cooperation and Trust with the Public, which includes representatives of professional practice and other relevant stakeholders, whose opinions and recommendations are documented in minutes and taken into account when adopting the study programs. In terms of cooperation with institutions and the business community, The Faculty is encouraged to engage in deeper and more structured cooperation, in order to understand the needs of the required profiles of lawyers and further develop its program orientation towards narrower profiling and specialization, especially in postgraduate studies, which can also be carried out in the existing accredited programs for both cycles with appropriate grouping of elective courses.
The study programs are developed/revised in cooperation with students and other relevant stakeholders (business community, state authorities and other organizations). The information collected is analyzed, and the program is adjusted to avoid its obsolescence. The process creates an efficient learning environment and			The Faculty's study programmes are developed and revised in collaboration with students and other relevant stakeholders (business community, government bodies and other organisations). Students are part of the self-evaluation process, through membership in the University's Self-Evaluation Committee and in the unit committees. Part of the self-evaluation procedure is also the student survey, through which students' assessment of the quality of the study programmes is collected and formed. The Committee for

Criterion				Description
supports students.				Cooperation and Trust with the Public includes relevant representatives of the business community within the study programmes. The study programmes are subject to regular monitoring, review and revision within the framework of an established quality management system. These mechanisms ensure continuous updating through a process in which key stakeholders are informally involved. It is necessary to strengthen the role and influence of the Faculty's Advisory Board in providing strategic guidance and expert advice for the development and improvement of the study programmes. The Faculty may also consider inviting representatives from judicial and other institutions to participate in feedback panels to provide formative, invaluable input to the work of the students.
	X			
The study programs use external expertise and references. The program is aligned with the best foreign practices and experiences.	X			The subjects included in the study programs of the Faculty have been developed based on the positive experiences of the corresponding programs of renowned European and world universities. For example, the study program in Law, a one-year second-cycle academic program, has been developed in accordance with the study program in Law of the University of Belgrade (ranked between 201st and 300th in the Shanghai Ranking at the time of the development of this program), the Faculty of Law of Istanbul University (ranked between 401st and 500th), the Faculty of Law of the University of Vienna (ranked between 1st and 200th) and the Faculty of Law of the University of Bologna (ranked between 201st and 301st). The study programs include a variety of relevant learning activities, combining theoretical teaching with practical training, research-oriented assignments and international academic exposure. Teaching and assessment methods are aligned with learning outcomes, while opportunities for research, engagement with practitioners and participation in international academic activities enable students to achieve the intended academic and professional competencies. However, several important areas require further development to ensure that study programmes are fully aligned with recognised foreign practices in relation to the development of new legal disciplines, such as law in the digital age, philosophy of law and legal reasoning, etc. and contemporary pedagogical standards. It was also noted that critical thinking, which is an essential component of international academic frameworks, was not clearly embedded at the first cycle (undergraduate) level.
The study programs clearly define the overall expected work engagement of the student and include well-structured external activities (trainings, practical work and other activities that do not take place in the institution, but allow the student to gain experience in the field of his studies). The workload allows the student to participate in external activities during the studies. Practical teaching is appropriately valued in the workload and its implementation is regularly monitored.	X			The study programmes are fully aligned with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). ECTS credits are transparently allocated based on the total student workload, clearly defined by course and study cycle. Each curriculum defines the learning objectives, course content, ECTS credits allocated and provides a detailed breakdown of the student workload. The system supports student mobility and credit transfer, while practical and clinical training are formally regulated, documented, monitored and recognised as an integral part of the study. However, there remains a need to better organise students' practical work, through agreements with external institutions and companies.
The information about the study program published on the institution's website corresponds to the official records. The information is also published in the	X			Information about the study programs is available on the institution's website and corresponds to the official institutional documents. All details are provided in three languages - Macedonian, Turkish and English.

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULFILL	EXPLANATION
language in which the program is conducted.				
Higher education institutions monitor and periodically revise their study programs in order to achieve the set goals and meet the needs of students and the social community. The revision is aimed at continuous improvement of the study programs. All affected participants should be informed about the activities planned or undertaken based on the audit.	X			Documentation of continuous review of the study programmes was presented, and stakeholder interviews confirmed the assessment that the institution periodically monitors and reviews both study programmes. Teaching schedules, staffing and delivery are continuously documented through official schedules and annual reports of the faculty. New study subjects such as Constitutional Law of the Republic of Turkey, Constitutional Law of the United States of America, Civil Procedure Law of the Republic of Turkey, Criminal Procedure Law of the Republic of Turkey, EU Foreign and Security Policy have been introduced. The stability of the academic staff, regular monitoring and continuity of programme delivery over several academic years confirm the effective and reliable implementation of the programmes. However, it is necessary to strengthen the feedback procedure to stakeholders on the activities planned or undertaken based on the review and their impact on the improvement of the study programmes. their consistency and clear timeframes for improvement.
Statistical data (number of courses taught, number of students, grades, number and reasons for dropping out, etc.) are regularly monitored and systematically analyzed.		X		The analysis and systematic monitoring of statistical data related to the number of students, as well as the number and reasons for dropping out by academic year, are carried out in a timely manner by the Student Service and are included in the annual reports of the Rector. There are currently 119 students at the Faculty; there are a total of 380 students at the University. The institution systematically monitors the enrollment, progression and dropout of students across faculties and study cycles. Statistical data covering several academic years, including the reasons for students dropping out, are integrated into the annual work reports of the Rector. This evidence confirms the structured monitoring and use of student data for institutional and program management, but deeper analysis and transparency of the publication of statistical data and data obtained from self-evaluation are needed for program improvement.

FINDING: The higher education institution meets the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 3: STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT				
INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULFILL	EXPLANATION
The institution has developed a mechanism that ensures that programs are delivered in a way that motivates students to take an active part in creating the learning process and that student assessment reflects this process.				The Faculty has developed and implemented mechanisms that ensure that study programmes are implemented in a student-centred manner, motivating students to actively participate in the learning process. Students participate in the assessment and revision of study programmes, are invited to express their opinions on the delivery and have representatives in the bodies of the institution who represent them. Students receive the necessary information for enrolment, and a brochure for new students is also available.

	X			Good communication has been developed between the governing bodies of the University, professors, companies, institutions and students, through which they are encouraged to regularly attend classes and other activities, prepare for and take exams. Teaching methods and learning activities require continuous engagement of students, while assessment practices reflect this process through the evaluation of assignments, projects, seminar work and ongoing performance in addition to final exams.
The institution respects the diversity of students and their needs, and provides flexible learning approaches use different models of teaching implementation where possible as well as a variety of pedagogical methods.		X		The Faculty offers flexible learning paths through regulated part-time, distance learning and mentoring-based modes. There are clear procedures for the recognition of prior learning, exam equivalence and student mobility in line with ECTS and the Bologna principles. Good cooperation has been established with universities in Turkey and other Balkan countries. Student services and financial offices are available to students on a daily basis. Social and cultural activities organised by partner universities add depth to the overall experience, encouraging not only academic growth but also personal and intercultural development. The study system allows professors and teaching assistants to continuously monitor academic performance, covering both quantitative measures - such as mid-term and final exams - and qualitative aspects such as attendance, participation, presentations, project work and essays. The Faculty recognises the diversity of its students and has taken several steps to support diverse learning needs, including for students with disabilities.
The institution consistently updates its teaching methods to ensure they remain effective. Teaching is centered around interactive and student-oriented learning, focusing on the development of students' skills and competencies. The approach is interdisciplinary, utilizing case studies tailored to specific contexts. Additionally, the study program incorporates project-based learning to further engage students in real-world applications.		X		The faculty regularly adapts its teaching methods and applies interactive, student-oriented learning approaches. Teaching focuses on the development of skills and competencies through interdisciplinary content, case study-based learning adapted to the study cycle and active student participation. The study program systematically includes project-based learning through assignments, seminar papers, applied projects and thesis work, ensuring an efficient integration of theory and practice. The faculty has few classical lectures and many simulations. Students attend court proceedings in the city of Gostovar. The assessment of learning outcomes is carried out through the evaluation process, aligning learning outcomes with pedagogical methods. Regular examination reports offer a precise overview of student performance. Trainings on the use of teaching methods (mainly internal) were occasionally organized for the teaching staff.
All individuals involved in the assessment of students (teachers, associates, etc.) are well-versed in the established testing and examination methods and are provided with support to enhance their skills in this area. The assessment process incorporates a variety of formal evaluation tools, including laboratory exercises, assignments, projects, and other methods.		X		All academic staff involved in student assessment are familiar with the established testing and examination methods defined through institutional regulations and the course-level assessment framework (70% exam grade (colloquiums), 10% project and 20% activities). The institution provides continuous methodological and technical support through clear assessment guidelines and the University Management System (VIBIS). The assessment methods used include: written exams, oral presentations, individual and group projects, case study analysis, research essays and seminar papers, practical assignments, reports on the success of the practice, participation and attendance in classes. Through the sessions of the Academic Council, teachers are introduced to modern principles and practices for assessment and project-

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
				based learning, and evaluations of practice conducted in coordination with the Career Center.
The criteria and methods of evaluating and assessing students are published and known in advance.	X			All rules and criteria for learning and passing are shared with students at the beginning of the course, ensuring transparency and a clear understanding of the evaluation standards. They are made available to students through the curriculum. The criteria and procedures for student assessment, the distribution of points and examination procedures, are further regulated by institutional documents, namely the Rules for Study in the First and Second Cycles of Studies (available both online and in printed form) and are incorporated into the course programmes and ECTS documentation. Students are informed at the beginning of each semester about the assessment methods, assessment criteria, ensuring transparency, predictability and fairness in the assessment process.
Assessment provides students with the opportunity to showcase the level of their achieved learning outcomes. Students receive feedback that, when necessary, includes guidance for further learning. Assessments are conducted consistently and fairly for all students, in alignment with established procedures. The results correspond to the expected learning outcomes, and the assessment methods are tailored to the objectives of the courses. When applicable, assessments are carried out by multiple examiners to ensure fairness and objectivity.	X			Student grades are aligned with the expected learning outcomes of each course (defined in the curricula) and reflect the knowledge, skills and competences that students should acquire upon completion of the course. MS Teams is used in the learning and assessment process. Assessment allows students to demonstrate the level of learning outcomes achieved through methods aligned with the course objectives and learning outcomes. Assessment procedures are applied consistently and fairly to all students, based on established institutional rules. Students receive feedback during continuous and final assessments, including guidance for further learning where necessary. Assessment results are coherent across academic years and cycles, and in cases such as oral exams and thesis defense, assessment is carried out by multiple examiners.
The institution has a formal complaint procedure, including reporting of corruption by students in all types of studies. The system is functional and efficient.	X			The Faculty has a formal complaints procedure and a formal procedure for receiving reports of corruption from students. The institution has established a formal and legally based complaints procedure, including a specific mechanism for reporting corruption by students in all types and cycles of studies. An authorized person is appointed at the institutional level to receive complaints of corruption, and disciplinary procedures are regulated through internal acts. The system is functional and efficient, which is proven by regular reporting to the University Senate and continuous institutional supervision.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program /MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 4: STUDENT ADMISSION, PROGRESSION, RECOGNITION AND ASSESSMENT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION

The higher education institution appropriately implements the previously established and published regulations covering all stages of study, i.e. enrolment, progress during studies, diploma and certificates. The regulations are publicly available.	X		Enrollment in accredited cycles is carried out through a public competition in accordance with the Statute of the International University Vision (Annex 4.1.B.). The Faculty, in the implementation of its educational activity, determines the bases, criteria, rules and procedure for enrollment and study in the first and second cycles of studies in accordance with the Regulation on the conditions, criteria, rules and procedure for enrollment and study in the first cycle of studies (undergraduate studies) and the second cycle of studies (postgraduate studies) Annex 4.1.C.). The Regulation on Open School Studies (Annex 4.1.D.) regulates the organization of studies for students of open schools. There are also no practical problems for students from Turkey to enter North Macedonia. The institution has established, formally adopted and publicly available regulations that regulate all phases of the student life cycle, including admission, enrollment, progress in studies, completion of studies and issuance of diplomas, diploma supplements and certificates. These regulations are incorporated into the Statute and are further operationalized through detailed rulebooks covering full-time and part-time studies, admission procedures, student status, progression rules and certification processes. The regulatory framework is implemented consistently across all study cycles, ensures transparency, equal treatment and legal certainty for students and is fully aligned with national legislation and the ESG principles regarding admission, progression, recognition and certification of students.
The institution has developed a functional procedure and/or tools for collecting and monitoring student progress and acts on the basis of the information received.	X		The institution has developed and implemented functional procedures and tools for the systematic collection and monitoring of student progress. Relevant data is regularly collected, analyzed and used to inform academic and administrative decision-making processes, as well as to introduce measures aimed at improving student success and study outcomes. The institution acts on the basis of the information received, thus ensuring efficient monitoring of student progress throughout the entire study process.
The higher education institution has developed a procedure for the recognition of periods of study and prior learning, which includes the recognition of non-formal and formal learning, of students during their studies, including during student mobility.	X		The Faculty has developed and is implementing a formal procedure for the recognition of periods of study and prior learning, including both formal and non-formal learning. The procedure is applied throughout the studies and includes the recognition of learning outcomes achieved during student mobility. Recognition decisions are made in a transparent and consistent manner, ensuring continuity of studies and supporting student progress.
Upon completion of their studies, students receive Documentation that clarifies the acquired qualification, competences and learning outcomes, the level, content and status of the successfully completed studies. Documentation is clear, understandable and comprehensive.	X		In accordance with Article 155 of the Law on Higher Education, the framework and content of the diploma, certificate and diploma supplement are determined by the University. Students of the University, upon completion of their studies, receive documentation (certificate, diploma, diploma supplement) for the first and second cycle, which explains, i.e. lists all relevant information about the acquired qualification, competences and learning outcomes, the acquired level of education, the content and status of the successfully completed studies (Annex 4.4.C, Annex 4.4.D, Annex 4.4.E)

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 5: TEACHING STAFF[2]

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The higher education institution provides competent teaching staff for the implementation of study programs. The qualifications of the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the study programs are appropriate to the profile and concept of the studies as well as the planned teaching subjects.	X			The qualifications of the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the study programmes, the suitability of the profile and the concept of the academic studies are confirmed by Decisions on the titles of the teaching staff of the Faculty of Law (Annex 5.1.B). The Faculty maintains a List of CVs in Europass format of the engaged teaching staff for all study programmes of all study cycles. The CVs contain information about the last years, the teacher's profile, completed study cycles, acquired titles, scientific research work and results (Annex 5.1.A.). The qualifications, academic ranks, teaching experience and scientific activities of the staff members are fully aligned with the level, profile and content of the study programmes and the envisaged teaching subjects, thus ensuring the achievement of the planned learning outcomes.
The published works of the teaching staff in reference scientific publications in the last 5 years are relevant and contribute to the development of quality studies, i.e. the scientific field.	X			The teaching staff demonstrates active and continuous scientific engagement, with relevant publications in recognized scientific journals and proceedings in the last five years. Their works are aligned with the study programs and contribute to the development of the relevant scientific fields, as well as to high-quality research-based teaching.
The teaching workload is balanced. The teaching staff is engaged in accordance with legal provisions. The number of teaching hours per year is adequate for the implementation of quality teaching.	X			The University ensures a balanced and legally compliant distribution of teaching workload. Classes are distributed through formally adopted decisions of the Faculty. This was confirmed by the academic staff during a meeting with them. The teaching staff is engaged in accordance with applicable legal provisions, and teaching hours are distributed through formally adopted decisions of the Faculty. The scope and structure of teaching tasks support high-quality teaching and sustainable academic engagement.
The higher education institution has clear, transparent and fair recruitment processes, through working conditions that recognize the importance of teaching work. The process is based on academic qualifications and merit and offers equal opportunities for all candidates. The institution's practice corresponds to the established criteria.	X			The University has adopted the Regulation on the Systematization of Job Positions at Vision International University (Annex 5.4.A.), which regulates the rights and obligations of employees in accordance with the systematization of job positions at the University. This regulation establishes clear, transparent and fair procedures for employment and promotion based on academic qualifications and merit. The working conditions and job descriptions explicitly recognize the importance of teaching, research and academic service. The documented employment practices and academic appointments fully comply with the established criteria and the applicable legal and institutional frameworks.

---

[2] It refers to persons elected to teaching-scientific, teaching-professional, scientific, teaching and associate positions, who perform higher education activities.

The institution has developed a procedure for ensuring appropriate working conditions for the teaching staff. The staff has appropriate IT equipment, access to relevant electronic databases in the field/study program, appropriate spatial conditions, as well as other resources relevant to their work.	X			The University has developed and implemented procedures to ensure appropriate working conditions for teaching staff. Academic staff are provided with appropriate IT equipment, access to relevant electronic databases related to their fields and study programmes, as well as adequate office and teaching space, as well as other resources necessary for the performance of their professional duties.
The institution offers opportunities for professional development of the teaching staff and constantly motivates them; regularly organizes trainings for the teaching staff in order to develop proactive and innovative teaching methods, for their pedagogical and technical skills The institution regularly monitors the technical skills of the teaching staff.	X			The trainings and workshops are based on the University policies, the University Development Strategy and the Faculty work plans. Specific examples and results of best practices for motivating teaching staff in the last five years are presented in Annex 5.6.B. The University ensures continuous professional development of teaching staff through regular, institutionally supported trainings focused on innovative teaching methods, pedagogical development and technical competencies. The institution actively motivates staff participation, integrates digital and artificial intelligence-based tools into teaching practice and systematically monitors the technical skills of teaching staff, thus supporting high-quality and modern teaching delivery
The institution engages visiting teachers, renowned scientists, artists and experts from practice from the country and abroad within the framework of the implementation of the study program. Their profile is relevant to the study program and brings added value.	X			The University systematically engages visiting professors, renowned scientists and experts from the field from the country and abroad (Annex 5.7.C.). The Regulation on the conditions and manner of engaging a visiting professor at the International University Vision (Annex 5.7.A.) and the Regulation on the engagement of established scientists and practitioners in teaching (Annex 5.7.B.) have been adopted at the University. Their academic and professional profiles are fully aligned with the study programs and contribute to the enrichment of the curricula, internationalization and the overall quality of teaching and learning.
Scientific work is encouraged in order to strengthen the connection between teaching and science. The system functions well and is efficient.	X			The University and the Faculty encourage scientific work in order to strengthen the connection between teaching and science. Through clearly defined regulations, structured implementation of projects and active involvement of teaching staff and students in scientific activities, the system functions efficiently and contributes to high-quality teaching based on research. The journal "Sui generis" - Law Journal is published., The Institute for Balkan Studies is established. The teaching staff encourages students with monetary prizes for the best research papers.
The higher education institution encourages innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies.	X			The University actively encourages innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies. At the university level, a Commission for Information and Communication Technologies (Annex 5.9.A) operates to facilitate the effective implementation of electronic communication and information technologies. Through the systematic application of digital platforms, online assessment tools and interactive learning environments, the institution supports modern, student-centered and flexible teaching practices that improve the quality of learning and teaching.
The institution has an established system of academic integrity and prevention of plagiarism.				The University implements the Vision International University Academic Integrity and Anti-Plagiarism Policy, which regulates the standards for academic integrity and anti-plagiarism, as well as the procedure for determining un-

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
	X			academic conduct at Vision International University (Appendix 5.10.A.). The system clearly defines unacceptable practices, prescribes preventive measures and procedures for determining violations, and ensures consistent application, thereby protecting academic standards and integrity.
The institution has a policy/document/act for scientific research work. Indicators for scientific research work are established and regularly monitored.	X			The institution has established a comprehensive regulatory framework for scientific research through formally adopted policies and regulations. The Regulation on Scientific Research Activity of the Vision International University (Annex 5.11.B.). The Regulation on Scientific Research Activity establishes indicators for measuring and monitoring scientific research. The quality standard of the scientific research activity of the academic staff is assessed according to the results of scientific research through the following indicators of scientific research activity: productivity, impact, efficiency and hybrid mode (productivity + impact).
Scientific research work corresponds to local, regional and/or national development goals as well as the socio-economic and cultural context. The effect of scientific research work on local, regional and/or national development goals is regularly monitored, on the basis of which appropriate improvements are made.	X			The research work of the Faculty responds to local, regional and/or national development goals, as well as to the socio-economic and cultural context. The impact of the research work on local, regional and/or national development goals is regularly monitored. Through structured project implementation, mandatory reporting and institutional monitoring mechanisms, the impact of research activities is regularly assessed and used as a basis for continuous improvement and increased social relevance of the Faculty.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 6: LEARNING RESOURCES AND STUDENT SUPPORT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The institution provides adequate funding for learning and teaching activities and thus provides appropriate and easily accessible resources for learning and support for students. The system for financing the institution, i.e. study programs, is efficient and based on the needs of students. The institution has a comprehensive and efficient system for financing scientific and research activities.	X			The financial activities of the University are regulated by the Statute and the Regulation on Determining Salaries and Other Compensation of Employees of the International University of Vision. (Annex 6.1.A). The University ensures adequate and transparent funding for learning and teaching activities, providing accessible resources and comprehensive student support.
The technical resources of the institution (libraries, laboratories, work rooms, IT equipment, etc.) are adequate for the implementation of the study program. Students and teaching staff, including people with special needs, have access to all resources. The institution has an appropriate infrastructure for distance	X			The University provides adequate and accessible technical, spatial and IT resources to support the implementation of study programs. All students and staff, including persons with disabilities, have equal access to resources. The Regulation on the Inviolability of University Space and Provision of Spatial Conditions for Work and Attendance at Vision International University (Annex 6.2.B) regulates in more detail the premises which, with their capacity, size and equipment

Criteria			Description
learning. Technical resources are subject to regular monitoring in the institution.			(determined by the study programs), correspond to the specifics of the study programs implemented at the institution, as well as the needs of students, teaching and non-teaching staff.
The work of the support/administrative services is appropriately organized and serves the function of internal quality assurance. In their work, the services take into account flexible ways of learning and teaching as well as the needs of the different student population (for example, students older than 25 years, part-time and employed students, students from abroad and students with special needs). The number of employees in the support/administrative services and their profile is appropriate for the number of students in all types of studies. Support and administrative staff have the opportunity to develop their own competencies.	X		The institution has a well-organized and adequately staffed system of support and administrative services that directly contributes to internal quality assurance. These services respond to flexible learning models and the needs of a diverse student population, including part-time students, employees, international students and students with special needs. The number and profiles of staff are appropriate to the student body, and the institution ensures continuous professional development of support staff through regular training. The work of support/administrative services is regulated in an integrated manner at the University level. Regulations on the systematization of jobs at Vision International University have been adopted (Annex 6.3.B). These services respond to flexible learning models and the needs of a diverse student population, including part-time students, employees, international students and students with special needs.
The institution encourages the involvement of students in scientific research projects in all cycles of studies.		X	The University systematically encourages the involvement of students in scientific and research projects in all cycles of studies. Despite the efforts undertaken by the Faculty and the teaching staff, the participation of students from the Faculty in research projects remains extremely low and insufficient. Only master's students (Annex 6.4.B), who have already developed greater research skills and motivation, are regularly involved in such and similar projects,
Students have at their disposal specific forms of support including: an academic development advisor who monitors their development, provides support for career planning and other academic challenges and/or a functional Career Center, mentoring sessions, psychological support, etc.	X		According to the Regulation on the Organization of the Work of the Career Center of Vision International University (Annex 6.5.B), the Career Center functions integrally at the University level. The Career Center provides events and trainings for career counseling and professional orientation in accordance with pre-planned consultation sessions, career planning courses, special events such as open days, career days, educational presentations, spontaneous meetings initiated by students, etc.
The institution has a functional system for monitoring the members of the Alumni community. The Alumni community is included in the development plans of the institution. The institution organizes regular events and/or initiatives through which contact with graduated students is maintained.	X		The alumni database includes information on professional development and current positions. The information in the alumni database is updated periodically. Registration in the alumni database is done electronically. (Annex 6.6.E) The institution has established a functional system for monitoring the members of the alumni community through the Career Center, which maintains comprehensive and regularly updated records of alumni for all cycles of studies. This system enables continuous communication with graduates and provides a basis for the inclusion of alumni in institutional development and the organization of alumni-related initiatives and events.

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
Students actively participate in the management of the institution. A student assembly and a student ombudsman or his deputy operate within the institution. The institution supports the social, cultural and sports activities of students. It provides them with premises, support, and an annual budget.	X			According to the Statute of Vision International University (Annex 6.7.A), students participate in the management and decision-making for the protection of student rights. The Student Ombudsman is elected from among the regular students of law studies. So far, not a single complaint has been filed with the Student Ombudsman. The University systematically supports student social, cultural and sports activities by providing dedicated premises and organizational support.
Students are familiar with the services and opportunities available to them.	X			The University ensures that students are fully informed about the services and opportunities available to them through systematic orientation activities, digital platforms, regular trainings and continuous communication by academic and administrative units. Students confirmed that they have clear and constant access to information regarding academic, career, advisory and support services throughout their studies.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 7: INFORMATION MANAGEMENT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The higher education institution regularly collects, analyses and uses information that is important for the successful implementation of study programmes and other activities. Through an efficient process of collecting and analysing data on study programmes and other activities, the data is entered into the internal quality assurance system.	X			The data collection and processing system is hybrid - implemented both physically (in printed form) and electronically through the University Information System (UIS). The University Information System is supported by the Regulation on the Electronic System for Assessment and Monitoring of Students at Vision International University (Annex 7.1.G.). The institution regularly collects, analyzes and uses comprehensive data on study programs, student progress and academic staff performance through standardized reporting instruments and an integrated electronic monitoring system. The collected data is systematically incorporated into the internal quality assurance system and is used for evaluation, planning and continuous improvement of academic activities.
The information collected is relevant to the profile of the institution or study programmes and includes: key performance indicators; the profile of the student population; student progress, success and dropout rates; the degree to which students meet the expectations of the study programmes; the learning resources and support available to students, data on the employment of graduates and their careers, etc. Students and staff are involved in the processes of providing and analysing data as well as in the plannin of activities arising from them.	X			The electronic student assessment and monitoring system is regulated by the Regulation on the electronic student assessment and monitoring system of Vision International University (Annex 7.1.G.) and is an integrated platform that enables the digitalization of the academic and administrative processes of the University. Students and staff actively participate in data provision, analysis and planning, and the results are integrated into the internal quality assurance system to support evidence-based improvement and strategic development.
The institution keeps a register of				The University has an information protection system in place,

INDICATOR				EXPLANATION
significant events, activities and processes. The data is collected, analysed and used to meet the needs of the strategic management of the institution.	X			which ensures the security and privacy of data in printed and electronic form. This system includes measures to protect student data, exam results and discussions on digital platforms. The University has adopted an act regulating the protection of personal data and information, namely the Regulation on the Security of Data and Information Stored in Written and Electronic Form and on the Procedures for Reporting Security Breaches at Vision International University (Annex 7.4.F.). Data is collected and reviewed regularly and is used as an analytical basis for strategic management, quality assurance processes and continuous institutional development.
The security of information (in printed and electronic form) especially information related to student data, exam results, discussion on digital platforms, etc. is protected. The institution adequately protects the personal data of all stakeholders.	X			The University ensures a high level of information security and personal data protection through compliance with national legislation, clearly defined internal regulations, advanced technical safeguards, staff confidentiality obligations and formal incident response procedures. Personal data of students, staff and other stakeholders, both in hard copy and electronic form, are securely processed, stored and protected.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 8: PUBLIC INFORMATION

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The higher education institution regularly publishes data on its activities and study programmes. The information published on the website and other media (print, social media) of the institution is accurate, clear, precise, objective, up-to-date and easily accessible. The institution regularly participates in or organizes fairs at which it presents its activities and study programmes. Information relating to the activities of higher education institutions is useful for potential and current students, as well as for former students, other persons and the public.	X			The University and the Faculty regularly publish comprehensive and up-to-date information about their activities and study programs through their website, printed publications and other media. The Faculty actively promotes its academic offer through participation in national and international educational fairs and public information activities. The information provided is accurate, accessible and valuable for future and current students, alumni and the general public.
The higher education institution has published data on its activities, including information on the study programmes it implements, the admission criteria, the intended learning objectives, the qualifications that the student acquires as a result of the learning, the procedures applied in teaching, learning and assessment, the pass rates and the learning conditions available to students, information on the potential employment of graduates as well as the documents provided for in Article 21 paragraph 3 of the Law on Higher Education.	X			The University publishes comprehensive and up-to-date information on its study programmes and activities, including admission criteria, intended learning outcomes, qualifications obtained, teaching and assessment procedures, learning conditions, graduation rates and employment of graduates. All documents required under Article 21 paragraph 3 of the Law on Higher Education are publicly available, ensuring transparency and informed decision-making for students and the wider public.

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFIL	EXPLANATION
Key learning outcomes and research work are published on the institution's website. For example, before the defense of the doctoral dissertation, it is mandatory to publish it on the website of the higher education institution where the third cycle of studies is conducted (if applicable).	X			The documentation provided shows that the key learning results and research work are systematically documented and published through official institutional channels. A key learning outcome is the acquisition of staff who can work in the real sector without any formal or legal obstacles.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 9: INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND ININTERNATIONALIZATION

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFIL	EXPLANATION
Students actively use student mobility opportunities. Mobility is appropriately valued and recognized.	X			The University has adopted a Regulation on University Mobility Abroad and in the Country (Annex 9.1.B). The Faculty cooperates with several faculties abroad, primarily within the framework of the Erasmus+ program, namely with: Sakarya University, Turkey, Sakarya University of Applied Sciences, Turkey, Trakiya University, Turkey, Uşdkudar University, Turkey, Gelisim Sakarya University; Ankara University. Bilimler University, Turkey, Fatih Sultan Mehmet Vakıf University; Turkey, Samsun Ondokuz Mayis University, Turkey, Manisa Celal Bayar University, Republic of Turkey, International University in Novi Pazar, Serbia, Educons University, Serbia. Students actively participate (total 23) in international mobility programs, supported by a clear institutional and regulatory framework. Mobility periods are fully recognised through ECTS-based procedures, documented by formal equivalence certificates and recorded in the Diploma Supplement, ensuring that mobility is academically valued and directly contributes to students' qualifications.
The institution has developed a policy for international cooperation and internationalization. It has established Indicators for fulfilling the priorities of international cooperation and internationalization. These Indicators are regularly monitored. A special body responsible for international cooperation and internationalization within the institution has been designated.	X			The development of international cooperation and internationalization at the Faculty is based on the Strategy for the Development of the International University Vision for the period 2023-2026 (Annex 1.1.B.). The Faculty has established indicators for fulfilling the priorities of international cooperation and internationalization and these indicators are regularly monitored. An Office for International Cooperation operates within the University. The organization and work of the Office for International Cooperation are regulated by the Regulation on the Organization and Work of the Office for International Cooperation at the University (Annex 9.2.G.).
The institution has appropriate financial resources at its disposal for the implementation of international cooperation. For the needs of international cooperation, the institution allocates financial resources from its own revenues, but also uses funds from the national budget, foreign donors and programs, local government, etc.	X			The Faculty has the necessary financial resources to implement international cooperation. For this purpose, the Faculty uses its own revenues and funds at the university level. The financial resources that support international research, mobility and dissemination activities are planned, monitored and evaluated as part of the strategic and financial management of the University.

The institution cooperates with other institutions in the country and abroad in order to implement study programs. It implements joint projects with foreign universities (conferences, mobility and other collaborations), and the results of those projects are relevant to the study programs. The institution implements joint programs with foreign universities.	X		The Faculty cooperates with other institutions in the country and abroad to implement study programs. It also implements joint projects with foreign universities (conferences, mobilities and other collaborations), and the results of those projects are relevant to the study programs. Academic staff using the Erasmus program (Annex 9.4.B.).
The institution has established a system for attracting teachers and students from abroad. Foreign professors are regularly involved in teaching, are engaged as mentors or members of committees for evaluating master's and doctoral theses, etc. The number of foreign students is increasing.	X		The University has established a system for attracting teachers and students from abroad. Foreign professors are regularly engaged in teaching and as mentors or members of committees for evaluation of master's and doctoral theses, etc. The number of foreign students is increasing (Appendix 9.5.A. and B.). Foreign professors are regularly involved in teaching activities and contribute to the academic environment, while the institutional frameworks enable their inclusion in the mentoring and evaluation processes. These measures support the continuous growth of international student participation and the overall internationalization of the institution.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

SWOT Analysis of the institution

STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES
1. The University has good spatial and technical conditions for the implementation of its activities. 2. The Faculty of Law has a normative framework in line with the legal regulations regarding the accreditation requirements for its study programs and R&D 3. A well-documented internal quality assurance system has been developed, including systematic data collection, analysis, reporting and use of results for planning and improvement in teaching, research, student support and internationalization 4. The process has incorporated the necessary normative, institutional and operational mechanisms for monitoring and improving the quality of teaching 5. Strategies, rulebooks and procedures regarding employment, research, academic integrity have been developed 6. A good normative framework for international cooperation and student mobility has been set 7. Instruments and good practice for student support, information and data protection have been developed 8. The academic staff is provided with sufficient financial resources and a perfect infrastructure. 9. The student-centered approach dominates all aspects of student life.	1. Weak engagement of students in the research process 2. The process of monitoring alumni and cooperation with the business community and institutions could be improved and institutionalized. 3. For the development of R&D and the involvement of students in projects, more funds should be attracted from various sources
OPPORTUNITIES	**THREATS**
With international agreements and cooperation, to provide a strong foundation for development through implemented joint or double degree programs at master's levels Creating specializations especially at postgraduate studies i. Expanding partnerships with the public, institutions, judicial bodies, local self-government and industry. Further development of digital infrastructure.	Negative demographic trends in North Macedonia and the constant decrease in the number of full-time students High competition with similar institutions in North Macedonia European competition for international students, staff and funding Dependence on Erasmus+, EU projects and donor funding, which exposes the institution to risks related to program interruption or funding reduction

Recommendations for improvement of the institution

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Develop an integrated institutional quality and performance dashboard that consolidates existing data (student progress, dropout and completion rates, mobility, employability, research results, internationalization indicators)
- Strengthen formal mechanisms (advisory boards, annual consultations, structured surveys) for the involvement of former students and employers in the creation and adoption of work programs
- Creating a central register of international academic engagement, which will document: the roles of foreign professors in mentoring theses, co-supervising master's theses, joint research results related to teaching
- Build on the existing digital infrastructure and partnerships, a program of joint/double degree programs, expand English-language programs, introduce flexible and hybrid formats for international students and working students
- To introduce study course ""Informatic for lawyers", taking into account ft development of IT technologies.
- To create specalization of the Faculty at particular fields of law (decision is up to You)

- To formalize mechanisms (for example, advisory boards) involving alumni and employers in study improvement processes
- To develop joint/double degree programmes, expand English-taught programmes,introduce flexible and hybrid formats for international and working students
- To start collaborations with EU based institutions in order to foster copperation for joint projects like COST, Horizon, etc.
- - The faculty should strengthen its processes for student and stakeholder engagement to ensure that these groups are meaningfully involved in quality assurance and improvement activities.
- - Meetings involving students, employers and other stakeholders should be formally recorded, and these records should be publicly available on the institution's website to promote transparency and accountability.
- - The faculty should ensure the routine collection, analysis and dissemination of all key quantitative data for monitoring academic quality. This should include, but not be limited to, graduate destination, retention and progression rates, degree classifications and student-faculty ratios.
- - All meetings and decisions related to programme development, approval and review should be formally recorded and communicated to relevant stakeholders to ensure transparency and accountability. They should be published on the university's website.
- - The faculty should ensure that critical thinking is explicitly embedded and consistently articulated in the learning outcomes of programmes and modules at first cycle level, addressing any discrepancies in translation or documentation.
- - Assessment strategies should be improved to include a wider range of higher-order cognitive skills (analysis, evaluation, synthesis)
- - Literature tables should be updated
- - Professors' textbooks should be published in the three languages
- - The faculty should introduce formal mechanisms such as evaluation reports from employers to document and assess student performance during internships and inform ongoing program improvement.
- - Expand the use of innovative student-centered teaching methods, including flipped learning, posters and other active learning approaches commonly used in leading higher education institutions.
- - Provide staff development opportunities to ensure that teaching teams are familiar with and confident in the application of international pedagogical practices and digital tools.
- - Make key statistical reports available to relevant committees and stakeholders to support transparency and evidence-based decision-making.
- - Diversify the assessment process to include methods that promote active learning and soft skills development and other forms of authentic assessment.
- - Expand the range of pedagogical methods used across programmes to ensure that teaching is inclusive, flexible and responsive to the diverse needs of students.
- - Provide staff development to support the adoption of diverse teaching models and ensure their consistent implementation across all programmes.
- - Develop and implement a systematic process for regularly reviewing and updating teaching methods to ensure that they remain relevant, effective and aligned with international best practice.
- - Incorporate project-based learning to enhance real-world application, problem-solving and the development of students' core competencies.
- - Faculty should encourage and support staff to increase both the quality and quantity of research publications.
- - Establish transparent criteria and procedures for the allocation of research funds and monitor the efficiency of resource allocation.
- - Provide opportunities and incentives for staff and students to engage in research activities, ensuring alignment with strategic priorities and international expectations.research activity.
- - The faculty should establish a structured approach to the professional development of support and administrative staff, based on identified needs and the results of the annual evaluation.
- - The faculty could ensure that the results of the SWOT analysis are followed up with clear actions, with evidence of impact and continuous improvement.
- - The faculty should ensure that all published documentation, including program information and regulatory materials, is available at least in English to improve accessibility for international Incorporate project-based learning to enhance real-world application, problem-solving and the development of students' core competencies.
- - The faculty should encourage and support staff to increase both the quality and quantity of research publications.
- - Establish transparent criteria and procedures for allocating research funds and monitoring the efficiency of resource allocation.
- - The faculty should establish a structured approach to the professional development of support and administrative staff, based on identified needs and the results of annual evaluation.

Proposal from the external evaluation report

PROPOSAL

Based on the evaluation conducted, we propose EXTENSION of the accreditation of the higher education institution Faculty of Law.. In addition, we propose EXTENSION of the accreditation of the following study programs::
 Legal sciences Undergraduate Program (240 ECTS); Legal sciences Law Master`s Program (60 ECTS)

Voted in favor of this proposal: Akad.Vlado Kambovski, dr. Janis Grasis, dr.Dalibor Dolezal
Voted against this proposal:
Abstained:

SEPARATE OPINION