

Date: 28.10.2025			
Идентификациска бројка	Служба	Имя	Врзност
09	197/4		



To
 Evaluation Board
 Agency for Quality in the Higher Education

EXTERNAL ASSESSMENT REPORT

BASIC DATA

Name of the institution	University of Skopje. Faculty of Tourism
Location	Bul. Partizanski odredi 99, 1000 Skopje, Republic of North Macedonia
Members of the expert committee (name and surname, official contact information)	1 Acad.Vlado Kambovski 2 Dr Armand Faganel 3 Dr Wilfrid Flanda
Period of the visit to the higher education institution	Monday, 3 November 2025 to Tuesday 4 November 2025
Grounds for the External Assessment	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Annual plan <input type="checkbox"/> Request of the higher education institution <input type="checkbox"/> Request of the National Council for Higher Education and Scientific Research <input type="checkbox"/> Request of the Minister responsible for higher education
Decision on the establishment of the expert committee (decision number and date)	09-197/4 од 25.02.2025 09-197/19 од 20.10.2025

Evaluation on standards and indicators completion

STANDARD 1: INSTITUTIONAL POLICIES FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
<p>The institution has a quality assurance policy that is published and publicly available.</p>		X		<p>The institution presented the following quality assurance documents :</p> <p>a) QUALITY PLAN https://drive.google.com/file/d/1MyH3WACLsy7Y4Cyfdxv83gROJLFzwiUp/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>b) Plan for assessing results Faculty of Tourism 2020-24 https://drive.google.com/file/d/1GtfZBvJxbWbhm2vsfz8kFJlb7ys7YCkG/view?usp=sharing</p> <p>c) OAP UTMS Supplement – instruments for OAP implementation https://drive.google.com/file/d/1w7d_RhgB522HPIW9WZXXJYlu1pG-rn5s/view?usp=sharing</p> <p>d) QUALITY ASSURANCE AND QUALITY MANAGEMENT POLICY https://drive.google.com/file/d/1A3UpENn9sKdak6B7_VphwAfq-oNKMxx/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>e) POLICY FOR ENSURING THE QUALITY OF THE SCIENTIFIC AND RESEARCH WORK OF UTMS https://drive.google.com/file/d/1-OqrF9qmUr2dEAfpv3SMiQ2vWj0xaRc9/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>f) PROCEDURE FOR ENSURING THE QUALITY OF STUDY CURRICULUMS https://drive.google.com/file/d/10TgPApZ7PvvAxa31DrBbNp6qJcCi8kp8/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>g) PROCEDURE FOR ASSESSING THE QUALITY OF THE TEACHING PROCESS https://drive.google.com/file/d/1GI11qWK9RJD5q4KvPN1a15-fRfVwXs/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>h) QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROCEDURES https://drive.google.com/file/d/1H1CUybsRDacAOsSpvUuCjM69mgWsPihl/view?usp=drive_link</p> <p>Not all planning documents are accompanied by specific activities and measures for up-to-date monitoring of their implementation.</p>
<p>The institution has an efficient and logical system for ensuring the quality of education. It uses various tools for assessing and improving the quality of education and regularly conducts an evaluation that covers the subjects, teaching staff, the work of support/student services and the general level of satisfaction during the studies. The activities are carried out on the basis of a determined calendar of activities.</p>	X			<p>The Faculty of Tourism benefits from the work of several governing bodies, including the Advisory Board and the Accreditation and Evaluation Board. The Accreditation and Evaluation Board is responsible for the adoption and reaffirmation of the curriculum. The Faculty also monitors compliance with UNWTO policies and procedures through trained internal audit teams. In addition, the TEDQual framework provides objective external evaluation in its four cycles, contributing to the systematic monitoring of academic quality and standards.</p> <p>The Advisory Board strives to engage appropriately with key internal and external stakeholders, including students and employers. While mechanisms for engagement are in place, it is believed that the effectiveness and impact of these relationships on program development and improvement could be strengthened.</p> <p>Course Evaluation Questionnaire . The Quality Control Department oversees and monitors the implementation of the university's methodology to ensure continuous improvement</p>

		<p>and development of the teaching process. By achieving the department's goals and analyzing the results of announced and unannounced observations, a series of recommendations and priorities are identified for further improvement of the quality of academic programs. Based on the evaluation, the programs are innovated during each accreditation before the Accreditation Board.</p> <p>Instruments : End-of-course evaluation questionnaire; Evaluation of teaching staff; Software for evaluation of teaching staff with data; NNS (Scientific-Educational Meeting) for improving teaching and student performance; Action plan for improving the quality of teaching staff; Action plan for improving the quality of the university environment; Progress report and annual report prepared by the Dean of the Faculty of Tourism; Annual program of the Faculty of Tourism 2024-2025; Annual plan of the Faculty of Tourism for the academic year 2024-2025; Annual reports of the Faculty of Tourism 2024-2025; Progress report on the implementation of the OAP 2023/2024 for TEDQual certification; Progress report on improving the quality of the university environment; Minutes of the Educational-Scientific Council; OAP UTMS Supplement – Questionnaires and rubrics for self-evaluation; Indicators for monitoring the results of the implementation of the quality plan; Annual calendar of activities related to quality assurance.</p> <p>The results of these evaluations for the Faculty of Tourism are available in the Results of the Evaluation of Professors and Assistant Professors.</p> <p>Student feedback is routinely collected and has helped to drive some incremental improvements. However, employer representatives have not been able to demonstrate a clear or substantial influence on the design and ongoing review of the curriculum. There is also an absence of systematic and embedded peer review processes that support pedagogical development and staff development.</p>
<p>The management of the institution is committed to the development and improvement of the quality of education. There is a culture of coordination and cooperation between the parties concerned in the process. The institution encourages and ensures the involvement of students, employers and other relevant institutions/organizations in the process.</p>	<p>X</p>	<p>There is a commitment at the Faculty of Tourism to improving the quality of educational services. Discussions with staff and students showed that students are offered various opportunities to participate in fairs, internships and other activities that support both their professional profile and their broader learning experience. The care and activities to improve the quality of education are achieved through regular surveys and data analysis by management and professors , but the instruments for external evaluation of the result through the collection of data on the quality, knowledge and skills of graduated students in the institutions or companies where they are employed are insufficiently developed.</p> <p>However, mechanisms for involving students, employers and other stakeholders in quality-related decision-making require further development to ensure their robust, systematic and transparent operation. In particular, there is a need for clearer documentation and communication of the results resulting from stakeholder engagement activities.</p> <p>Interviews with employers, company representatives and other external stakeholders showed that they are not very familiar with and involved in building a methodology and applying self-evaluation instruments, as well as analyses of</p>

			<p>teaching quality and improving curricula .</p> <p>The Faculty of Tourism should consider adopting a recognized sector practice to demonstrate how student feedback influences decision-making and program alignment.</p>
A separate body responsible for the development and implementation of the quality assurance policy operates within the institution.		X	<p>UTMS has a dedicated team responsible for monitoring, together with a Quality Control Department, which works under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Science and Development. More intensive activity by the Department is needed, which would include quality control of self-evaluation instruments and their implementation and the action taken on recommendations for improving the quality of teaching and other activities of professors and students. However, the criterion is only partially met because some of the evidence provided was outdated. Annex 1.1 b) 1, Performance Assessment Plan for the Faculty of Tourism, was presented as covering the period from 2020 to 2024, but the document itself refers to the academic year 2018 to 2019. This discrepancy raises concerns about the accuracy and timeliness of the documentation and limits the ability to verify that quality assurance processes are regularly updated and aligned with ongoing improvements.</p>
The institution regularly analyzes the information arising from the quality assurance system, including statistical information, and takes measures to improve the study programs based on that information. The self-evaluation report is published on the institution's website.		X	<p>UTMS conducts institutional self-evaluations every 2 to 3 years in accordance with the Law on Higher Education, while evaluations of academic staff are conducted annually. Corrective measures arise from self-evaluation reports. The self-evaluation report is publicly available (https://www.utms.edu.mk/images/Samoevaluacija/Samoevaluacija_na_UTMS_2022.pdf).</p> <p>However, the range of data available for review was limited and did not provide a sufficiently comprehensive evidence base to support effective monitoring and improvement of study programs.</p> <p>In particular, key statistical indicators that are typically expected in a robust quality assurance framework, such as graduate destination, retention and progression rates, degree classifications, and student-faculty ratios, were not provided. The absence of these data sets limits the institution's ability to systematically assess program performance and take informed measures for improvement.</p> <p>The institution has published its Self-Evaluation Reports (2012, 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016, 2017-2019*, 2022) on the university website. Some reports appear to be missing, and those that are available should be provided at least in English. The insights into the results of the self-evaluation are complicated by the merger of the Faculty of Tourism with the Faculty of Economics, as well as by the generality of the University's self-evaluation report.</p>
Quality assurance in the institution is a continuous process that does not end with the External Assessment Report or with the further monitoring of the institution. The recommendations from the previous external assessment have been implemented. The progress		X	<p>The Faculty of Tourism's approach to quality assurance is at an early stage of development. Although the institution has started to establish structures and processes to support continuous monitoring and improvement (i.e. TEFQUAL, etc.), they remain urgent and require further strengthening to align with recognised international practice, including standards commonly applied across the European higher</p>

achieved since the last external assessment has been clearly demonstrated¹

education sector. It is therefore important that the recommendations arising from this evaluation are fully implemented and incorporated into the institution's evolving quality assurance framework.

Over the past 11 years, UTMS has successfully renewed its UNWTO TedQual certificate for undergraduate studies for the third time, achieving a compliance rate of 84% in 2015 and 89.11% in 2021, and 91% in 2024. The recommendations from the external assessment have been implemented.

FINDING: The higher education institution DOESN'T MEET the above Standard.

STANDARD 2: DESIGN AND APPROVAL OF RPROGRAMMES

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
<p>The institution has adopted an act/s or rules regulating the procedure for the development and approval of study programs for the first, second and third cycle of studies (if applicable).</p>	X			<p>The institution has established documentation for the development and approval of first and second cycle study programs, including a policy and procedures for creating curricula, as well as a Procedure for Improving the Quality of Study Programs, which defines the procedures and key actors: companies, alumni, the advisory board and faculty bodies.</p> <p>The Faculty of Tourism has formally recognized the procedures for the development and approval of study programs and they are to some extent embedded in practice, but further improvement is needed to ensure consistency and accountability. The most recent self-evaluation report published by the University on its website dates from 2022.</p> <p>To ensure the efficient functioning of the programme development and review processes, clearer structures, documented timelines and transparent communication with stakeholders are needed. In particular, the actions and decisions taken through these processes should be formally recorded and made available to relevant internal and external stakeholders. Furthermore, the Advisory Board has an important role in overseeing the development of programmes and should therefore take a more proactive stance in guiding, coordinating and monitoring these activities.</p>
<p>The content of the study programs offered at the institution is well designed and described. It is relevant to the purpose of the program and the achievement of learning outcomes. The objectives of the subjects are defined and aligned with the outcome of the educational process (learning outcome). The study programs are designed with the aim of uninterrupted student development and enable students to acquire academic knowledge and skills, including those that can be transferred, which means that they can influence their personal development and can be</p>	X			<p>The study programs in Tourism - First Degree and Tourism - Postgraduate Studies offered at the institution are well aligned horizontally and vertically, enabling students to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills. Graduates are able to enter the labor market, prepared for the challenges of modern tourism management and to continue with further personal and business growth.</p> <p>The learning outcomes intended for students from both study programs are comparable to those of the faculties of tourism in North Macedonia, the Faculty of Tourism in Opatija, with which the University It also works closely with other foreign institutions. The documentation reviewed during the evaluation provides a coherent overview of the program's objectives, course assignments, and overall structure</p>

¹ This indicator will be subject to assessment after the completion of the first External Assessment, i.e. during the next External Assessment of the institution.

<p>applied in the development of their future professions.</p>			<p>designed to support the academic and professional development of students.</p> <p>However, during discussions with programme directors and teaching staff, it was noted that the embedding of critical thinking at the first cycle (undergraduate) level was not clearly demonstrated. Staff confirmed that critical thinking is explicitly included in the second cycle curricula, but attributed its absence at the first cycle level to a translation error. This gap raises concerns about the consistency in the design of learning outcomes across study cycles.</p> <p>Furthermore, there was no clear evidence of how soft skills such as leadership, communication, teamwork, problem-solving, etc. were intentionally developed and assessed in both cycles.</p> <p>Undergraduate program</p> <p>The literature tables for semesters 1 – 8 show some outdated literature resources. https://ft.utms.edu.mk/images/Programa/en/FT_1.pdf</p> <p>Postgraduate studies</p> <p>Program</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 9th semester literature table shows some outdated literature resources https://ft.utms.edu.mk/images/Programa/en/FT_9.pdf • Semester 10 There are no literary sources. https://ft.utms.edu.mk/images/Programa/en/FT_10.pdf
<p>The study programs respond to the development needs of society and the economy.</p>	X		<p>Both study programs are relevant and aligned with the labor market and societal expectations, the institution benchmarks the content of its study programs with other faculties , the needs and recommendations of the tourism sector are conveyed in the curriculum through market and SWOT analysis, as well as through the findings of the focus groups of former students, and are integrated into the curricula.</p> <p>Good practice was noted in the availability of internships, participation in Erasmus+ mobility programs and positive feedback provided by employers who met with the panel. These initiatives contribute to improving the employability of students and support the alignment between the program outcomes and labor market expectations.</p>
<p>The study programs are developed/revised in cooperation with students and other relevant stakeholders (business community, state authorities and other organizations). The information collected is analyzed, and the program is adjusted to avoid its obsolescence. The process creates an efficient learning environment and supports students.</p>		X	<p>Both study programs are designed and regularly updated through a continuous process that informally involves key stakeholders. The Faculty Advisory Board provides strategic guidance and expert advice for the development and improvement of the study programs. It plays a vital role in ensuring the relevance and quality of academic offerings by aligning them with current trends in the tourism sector, labor market demands, and societal priorities.</p> <p>The Faculty of Tourism demonstrates some engagement with students and external stakeholders in the development and review of its study programs.</p> <p>In relation to the business community, the Faculty is encouraged to seek deeper and more structured collaboration. Opportunities include inviting guest speakers, including from international organizations via MS Teams; developing virtual internships with leading companies across Europe and</p>

		beyond; and embedding small applied research projects in partnership with employers. The Faculty may also consider inviting industry representatives to participate in feedback panels to provide formative, invaluable input into the work of students.
The study programs use external expertise and references. The program is aligned with the best foreign practices and experiences.	X	<p>Both study programs are designed in accordance with international standards and best practices in tourism education. The first-cycle tourism study program is modeled after the program from Cornell University (ranked 12th in the Shanghai Ranking). More than 80% of the courses correspond to the Cornell curriculum. Professors from foreign partner institutions give lectures through incoming mobility. The Faculty of Tourism shows some engagement with external expertise and reference points, especially in terms of student employment, where compliance with international expectations is evident. However, several important areas require further development to ensure that the study programs are fully aligned with recognized foreign practices and contemporary pedagogical standards.</p> <p>It was noted that critical thinking, an essential component of international academic frameworks, was not clearly embedded at the first cycle (undergraduate) level, as previously discussed and confirmed in the documentation.</p> <p>In terms of teaching methods, the integration of student-friendly digital tools (e.g., Mentimeter, Kahoot, Padlet) was limited, with only one staff member indicating awareness of such platforms. Greater adoption of interactive and technology-enhanced learning strategies would align programs with international expectations and improve the overall student learning experience.</p>
The study programs clearly define the overall expected work engagement of the student and include well-structured external activities (trainings, practical work and other activities that do not take place in the institution, but allow the student to gain experience in the field of his studies). The workload allows the student to participate in external activities during the studies. Practical teaching is appropriately valued in the workload and its implementation is regularly monitored.	X	<p>The study programmes clearly state the total student workload in accordance with ECTS standards - 240 ECTS for the first cycle and 60 ECTS for the second cycle. Each curriculum defines the learning objectives, the course content, the ECTS credits awarded and provides a detailed breakdown of the student workload. Students complete a mandatory practical training each academic year, lasting 30 working days, in tourism-related organisations, in the country or abroad. These internships are organised through formal cooperation agreements and are jointly supervised by mentors. To ensure accountability and to verify learning outcomes, students must submit a practical training diary upon completion.</p> <p>Study program of the Faculty of Tourism, first cycle with course programs (syllabuses).pdf - No <u>English translation</u></p>
The information about the study program published on the institution's website corresponds to the official records. The information is also published in the language in which the program is conducted.	X	The information about study programs is available on the institution's website and corresponds to official institutional documents. All details are provided in Macedonian, ensuring transparency and accessibility for both prospective and current students

<p>Higher education institutions monitor and periodically revise their study programs in order to achieve the set goals and meet the needs of students and the social community. The revision is aimed at continuous improvement of the study programs. All affected participants should be informed about the activities planned or undertaken based on the audit.</p>	X	<p>Documentation for continuous revision of study programs was presented: Report on teaching and monitoring of teaching; Procedure for assessing the quality of the teaching process; Indicators for monitoring the results of the implementation of the quality plan (teaching); Instruments for monitoring the quality of teaching; Overview of the revised study programs at the Faculty of Tourism / Stakeholder interviews confirmed the assessment that the institution periodically monitors and revises both study programs .</p> <p>providing feedback to stakeholders on the actions planned or undertaken based on the audit and their results is not sufficient. impact on the improvement of study programs. The Faculty of Tourism carries out some monitoring and review of its study programs; however, these processes are not yet systematic or comprehensive enough to ensure continuous improvement aligned with student needs and broader societal expectations. As discussed in previous sections of the report, the Faculty has established policy- level procedures, but their implementation lacks consistency, clear timelines, and robust documentation.</p>
<p>Statistical data (number of courses taught, number of students, grades, number and reasons for dropping out, etc.) are regularly monitored and systematically analyzed.</p>	X	<p>The institution monitors and analyses statistical data, including the number of students enrolled, average course grades and the number of students who drop out or temporarily interrupt their studies, but this is not analysed and presented in the self-evaluation reports. Although the Faculty of Tourism collects some statistical information, key data sets needed for systematic monitoring and analysis were not provided. Information such as progression rates, retention data, reasons for student withdrawal and detailed grade distribution were not available to the panel. The absence of these essential indicators limits the Faculty's ability to conduct meaningful analysis of programme performance and effectively use evidence to inform programme review and improvement.</p> <p>Without comprehensive and systematically analyzed data, it is unclear how the Faculty identifies trends, diagnoses problems, or evaluates the effectiveness of improvement measures.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution **MEETS** the above Standard. The study program **MEETS** the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 3: STUDENT-CENTERED LEARNING, TEACHING AND ASSESSMENT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
<p>The institution has developed a mechanism that ensures that programs are delivered in a way that motivates students to take an active part in creating the learning process and that student assessment reflects this process.</p>	X			<p>Students participate in the assessment and revision of study programs, are invited to express their opinions on the delivery and have representatives in the bodies of the institution, who represent them. Students receive the necessary information for enrollment, and a brochure for new students is also available. Students are assigned official e-mail addresses and passwords to access the student portal "E-student". There they can view the academic schedule, work plan, study programs, lecture presentations, the e-library and other useful</p>

		<p>information.</p> <p>Good communication has been developed between the University's governing bodies, professors, the companies in which they do their internships, and the students, through which they are encouraged to regularly attend classes and other activities, prepare for, and take exams.</p>
<p>The institution respects the diversity of students and their needs, and provides flexible learning approaches use different models of teaching implementation where possible as well as a variety of pedagogical methods.</p>	X	<p>The Student Office, Legal, IT and Finance offices are available to students daily from 08:30 to 16:30, and every third Sunday of the month until 21:00. A teaching assistant is assigned as a mentor for each academic year, providing individualized support to students. Social and cultural activities organized by the partner universities add depth to the overall experience, encouraging not only academic growth, but also personal and intercultural development. Each student receives individual support during the application process from an assigned coordinator, ensuring a smooth transition into the exchange program or study program. To maintain a consistent overview of student progress, the university uses a digital platform called "Assistant Monitor". This system allows professors and teaching assistants to continuously monitor academic performance, covering both quantitative measures - such as midterm and final exams - and qualitative aspects such as attendance, participation, presentations, project work and essays. Student evaluation is guided by two formal frameworks: the Student Achievement Assessment Procedure and the Student Success Analysis Procedure, providing a comprehensive and transparent approach to measuring learning outcomes.</p> <p>The Faculty of Tourism recognizes the diversity of its students and has taken several steps to support diverse learning needs. For example, a student with a disability received support during class from another student through a separate tuition fee agreement. However, the student supporting the program did not receive any training to prepare for this responsibility.</p> <p>Current teaching approaches could be improved to fully reflect modern student-centered practices or to provide sufficient flexibility to accommodate different learning styles.</p>
<p>The institution consistently updates its teaching methods to ensure they remain effective. Teaching is centered around interactive and student-oriented learning, focusing on the development of students' skills and competencies. The approach is interdisciplinary, utilizing case studies tailored to specific contexts. Additionally, the study program incorporates project-based learning to further engage students in real-world applications.</p>	X	<p>In 2022/23, a review of pedagogical methods was carried out, resulting in a report on a corrective action plan regarding teaching methods through lectures, case studies, simulation games, e-learning, problem-based learning. The electronic platform allows for continuous assessment and monitoring of student progress, while students have the opportunity to monitor their rankings and progress. The assessment of learning outcomes is carried out through the evaluation process, aligning learning outcomes with pedagogical methods. Monthly examination report cards offer a precise overview of student performance.</p> <p>The corrective action plan focused on modifying case studies, increasing the frequency of simulation games and improving the integration of e-learning. In addition, more tutoring and workshops on critical thinking and problem solving were offered. Trainings on the use of teaching methods (mainly internal) were occasionally organized for the teaching staff and a system for peer review of teaching was established.</p>

<p>All individuals involved in the assessment of students (teachers, associates, etc.) are well-versed in the established testing and examination methods and are provided with support to enhance their skills in this area. The assessment process incorporates a variety of formal evaluation tools, including laboratory exercises, assignments, projects, and other methods.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>The assessment methods used include: written exams and quizzes, oral presentations, individual and group projects, case study analysis, research essays and term papers, practical assignments, reports on the success of the internship, participation and attendance in classes. Through the sessions of the Academic Council, teachers are introduced to modern assessment principles and practices. In the applied courses, assessment methods extend beyond traditional exams and include: simulated business scenarios, fieldwork and project-based learning, laboratory exercises, practice evaluations conducted in coordination with the Career Center. To ensure consistency and fairness in assessment, the institution uses standardized rubrics for assessing the main tasks such as essays, presentations, internship reports and project work , fully aligned with the intended learning outcomes of each course. The staff involved in assessing students have an understanding of the established testing and examination methods currently in use. Evidence is needed for a wider range of formal evaluation tools, such as authentic assessment, to be systematically incorporated into assessment practices.</p>
<p>The criteria and methods of evaluating and assessing students are published and known in advance.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>All of the above rubrics are shared with students at the beginning of the course, ensuring transparency and a clear understanding of the evaluation standards. They are available to students through the curriculum or the E-student platform. The criteria and procedures for student assessment are further regulated by institutional documents, specifically the Rules for Study in the First and Second Cycles of Studies. (available both online and in print) describe the university's overall approach to assessing student performance, including passing standards, grade conversion scales, re-examination policies, and grade appeal procedures. The grading system and procedures are also introduced to new students on orientation day and in their first academic class.</p>
<p>Assessment provides students with the opportunity to showcase the level of their achieved learning outcomes. Students receive feedback that, when necessary, includes guidance for further learning. Assessments are conducted consistently and fairly for all students, in alignment with established procedures. The results correspond to the expected learning outcomes, and the assessment methods are tailored to the objectives of the courses. When applicable, assessments are carried out by multiple examiners to ensure fairness and objectivity.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>Student grades are aligned with the expected learning outcomes of each course (defined in the curricula) and reflect the knowledge, skills and competences that students should acquire upon completion of the course. Assessment methods are selected and designed to measure specific outcomes (theoretical knowledge through written examinations, applied skills through projects, presentations and practical exercises). If possible, oral examinations, project defenses or evaluations of master's theses are conducted by multiple examiners. Exam grading is provided through comprehensive grading and analysis software, exams are anonymous, each student receives a code, exams are entered into a scanner, and the result is recorded directly into the system.</p>
<p>The institution has a formal complaint procedure, including reporting of corruption by students in all types of studies. The system is functional and efficient.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>There is a formally regulated procedure for filing complaints by students, including reports of corruption - the Student Complaints and Appeals Procedure. In the last five years, 82% of the complaints filed have been resolved positively in favor of the students, and the remaining 18% have been dismissed or dismissed as unfounded.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 4: STUDENT ADMISSION, PROGRESSION, RECOGNITION AND ASSESSMENT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
The higher education institution appropriately implements the previously established and published regulations covering all stages of study, i.e. enrolment, progress during studies, diploma and certificates. The regulations are publicly available.	X			Before the start of each academic year, candidates receive a student handbook to familiarize them with the enrollment requirements, study programs and policies, UTMS methodology, teaching staff, departments, teaching, extracurricular activities and financial obligations. Students are also provided with information on the website and intranet about the e-library, technical equipment, career center, contacts with UTMS staff, code of conduct, financial obligations, location of UTMS and holidays in the country. The brochure for new students is also a source of key information.
The institution has developed a functional procedure and/or tools for collecting and monitoring student progress and acts on the basis of the information received.	X			The electronic platform allows for continuous assessment and monitoring of student progress, while students have the opportunity to monitor their rankings and progress. The assessment of learning outcomes is carried out through the evaluation process, aligning learning outcomes with pedagogical methods. Monthly examination reports offer a precise overview of student success. precise overview of student success.
The higher education institution has developed a procedure for the recognition of periods of study and prior learning, which includes the recognition of non-formal and formal learning, of students during their studies, including during student mobility.	X			According to the Regulation on Studying Cycle I (Articles 13-15) and the Regulation on Studying Cycle II (Articles 15-17), and the Law on Higher Education, the institution has adopted a procedure for the recognition of prior learning. Due to national legislation, there is no legal framework for the recognition of non-formal education. Student mobility was realized by 4 students on internships abroad, there was no learning mobility.
Upon completion of their studies, students receive Documentation that clarifies the acquired qualification, competences and learning outcomes, the level, content and status of the successfully completed studies. Documentation is clear, understandable and comprehensive.	X			The University has a Regulation on the content and form of the diploma, guidelines for the preparation of the diploma supplement and other public documents. Graduates receive a diploma, a diploma supplement and a certificate. The diploma supplement contains a description of the studies - the type of studies and their degree, context, content and status. There is an average of the percentages of the knowledge, skills and competences acquired by students during their studies, the average success of the student during their studies and a comprehensive classification.

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 5: TEACHING STAFF²

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
-----------	---------------------	--------------------	-------------------	-------------

² It refers to persons elected to teaching-scientific, teaching-professional, scientific, teaching and associate positions, who perform higher education activities.

<p>The higher education institution provides competent teaching staff for the implementation of study programs. The qualifications of the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the study programs are appropriate to the profile and concept of the studies as well as the planned teaching subjects.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>The teaching staff has academic titles awarded through national procedures in accordance with the Law on Higher Education and institutional regulations, in relation to the level of the study program they are engaged in. Their academic and professional profiles most often correspond to the assigned subjects they teach, but not all. For example: Prof. Dr. Milenkovski is habilitated in Methodology and Geography, but one of the subjects he teaches is Tour Operators and Travel Agencies.</p>
<p>The published works of the teaching staff in reference scientific publications in the last 5 years are relevant and contribute to the development of quality studies, i.e. the scientific field.</p>		<p>X</p>	<p>The teaching staff is active in publishing research papers, formally they contribute to the development of the scientific field. However, the quality of the journals in which they publish is mostly not very high. Except for one teacher, who published two papers in SSCI/SCI journals, almost all the others publish in national and/or journals without an impact factor, thus formally meeting the conditions stipulated in the Law on Higher Education for election to a title or for promotion. Also, the production (if we exclude the two most productive teachers) is not very high for a period of five years - 3.8.</p>
<p>The teaching workload is balanced. The teaching staff is engaged in accordance with legal provisions. The number of teaching hours per year is adequate for the implementation of quality teaching.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>According to the submitted document "Overview of Teaching Hours and Subjects", the workload of the teaching staff is in accordance with the provisions of the Law on Higher Education, specifically Article 161, paragraphs 9 and 10. The institution also demonstrated through employment contracts that 15 teachers are fully employed, which meets the legal minimum for accreditation.</p>
<p>The higher education institution has clear, transparent and fair recruitment processes, through working conditions that recognize the importance of teaching work. The process is based on academic qualifications and merit and offers equal opportunities for all candidates. The institution's practice corresponds to the established criteria.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>The procedures for choice on professors and assistants in the institution everything perform in consent with the criteria defined in the " Rules on the unique criteria and procedures for selection into teaching-scientific, educational, teaching and professional and associate titles " adopted by the University Senate, in accordance with Article 52, paragraph 1, item 22 of The law for high education (Official newspaper of the Republic of Macedonia No. 35/08) and in relationship with Article 92, paragraph 1, item 23 of The Statute on The University in Skopje .</p> <p>The procedure consists of five steps: publishing a public call for the selection of teachers, a decision to select a review committee responsible for preparing the review, publishing the reviews in the University bulletin and on the university website, making a decision to select teachers by the Faculty's Teaching and Scientific Council or the University Senate for full professors, and finally notifying all participants of the selection.</p>
<p>The institution has developed a procedure for ensuring appropriate working conditions for the teaching staff. The staff has appropriate IT equipment, access to relevant electronic databases in the field/study program, appropriate spatial conditions, as well as other resources relevant to their work.</p>	<p>X</p>		<p>Teachers have constant access to the necessary IT equipment, specialized equipment and laboratories, electronic databases relevant to their field of study and research (Emerald, Scopus, ProQuest, EBSCOhost, etc.), appropriate spatial conditions and support for professional development, with trainings, webinars...</p> <p>Access to the e-student library system and the UNWTO electronic library is also provided.</p> <p>The institution is gradually upgrading its equipment and promoting digitalization.</p>

<p>The institution offers opportunities for professional development of the teaching staff and constantly motivates them; regularly organizes trainings for the teaching staff in order to develop proactive and innovative teaching methods, for their pedagogical and technical skills</p> <p>The institution regularly monitors the technical skills of the teaching staff.</p>	X		<p>The institution motivates teachers in their professional development; along with some internal training, they participated in capacity-building programs, international conferences, and externally organized workshops funded by Erasmus+ and UNWTO.</p> <p>The annual work implementation reports provide an overview of the training of the teaching staff, who were employed individually.</p> <p>In the last five years, ten mobilities have been implemented through Erasmus+, in which 8 staff members participated mostly at the University of Telecommunications and Post in Sofia, Bulgaria, which is a leading Bulgarian higher education institution in the fields of telecommunications, computer science and engineering.</p>
<p>The institution engages visiting teachers, renowned scientists, artists and experts from practice from the country and abroad within the framework of the implementation of the study program. Their profile is relevant to the study program and brings added value.</p>	X	X	<p>The institution has concluded agreements and memorandums of cooperation with foreign faculties - Faculty of Tourism and Hospitality in Opatija and others. An Advisory Board for Trust and Cooperation has representatives from the public and private sectors who focus their opinions and suggestions on real situations and needs of business. Nine guest lecturers and eight experts from the public and private sectors have come to UTMS in the last five years.</p>
<p>Scientific work is encouraged in order to strengthen the connection between teaching and science. The system functions well and is efficient.</p>	X		<p>The institution organizes a biennial international scientific conference ICONBEST. UTMS Journal of Economic is a scientific journal published twice a year.</p> <p>However, staff are not given any discount on teaching hours if they are doing project work.</p>
<p>The higher education institution encourages innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies.</p>	X		<p>The application presents a number of innovative teaching methods, but there is still room for improvement and continuous education in this direction. There was insufficient evidence of systematic efforts to promote modern pedagogical approaches or the integration of digital tools that support active, student-centered learning. Teaching practices remain limited and do not reflect current developments in higher education.</p>
<p>The institution has an established system of academic integrity and prevention of plagiarism.</p>	X		<p>UTMS uses the plagiarism checking tool Turnitin, as well as the Plagijati application from the Ministry of Education of North Macedonia. Scientific papers and master's theses are checked for originality and authenticity.</p>
<p>The institution has a policy/document/act for scientific research work. Indicators for scientific research work are established and regularly monitored.</p>	X	X	<p>The institution has adopted a Policy for Scientific Research Work at UTMS. The indicators for quality research work and the conditions for selecting a title are quite loose. UTMS only requires the production of a certain number of scientific publications, without specifying the quality of the journals in which the articles are published, the prescribed number of citations, etc.</p>
<p>Scientific research work corresponds to local, regional and/or national development goals as well as the socio-economic and cultural context. The effect of scientific research work on local, regional and/or national development goals is regularly monitored, on the basis of which appropriate improvements are made.</p>		X	<p>UTMS is well integrated into various professional associations in the country, cooperating with ministries, agencies in the field of tourism, business associations and chambers. This helps in the development of regional and national goals in this field. Students develop their theses and other works (projects) as field studies in tourism companies and hotels. However, scientific research is poorly developed, the teaching staff is involved in some Erasmus+ projects and one Horizon project.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).

STANDARD 6: LEARNING RESOURCES AND STUDENT SUPPORT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
<p>The institution provides adequate funding for learning and teaching activities and thus provides appropriate and easily accessible resources for learning and support for students. The system for financing the institution, i.e. study programs, is efficient and based on the needs of students. The institution has a comprehensive and efficient system for financing scientific and research activities.</p>	X			<p>UTMS has been recording positive results in recent years, with the majority of costs related to staff salaries, which is common in higher education. To ensure a better position and more funds for students and to update equipment at a faster pace, an even greater commitment to the procurement of research and professional projects will be required.</p> <p>The system for financing study programs appears functional and responsive to the needs of students. However, the criterion is only partially met as the Faculty's approach to funding scientific and research activities remains underdeveloped. There was insufficient evidence of a comprehensive or effective research support system, nor clear mechanisms for allocating resources to promote scientific activity, staff research development or research-based teaching.</p>
<p>The technical resources of the institution (libraries, laboratories, work rooms, IT equipment, etc.) are adequate for the implementation of the study program. Students and teaching staff, including people with special needs, have access to all resources. The institution has an appropriate infrastructure for distance learning. Technical resources are subject to regular monitoring in the institution.</p>		X		<p>The quantity and quality of technical equipment required for the educational needs of students is adequate and is regularly monitored.</p> <p>The library collection contains 8,499 titles and 20,935 copies of physical and electronic resources. The necessary literature is available to students, but the prescribed literature in the curricula is outdated; for undergraduate studies it ranges from 2005 to 2015; while for master's studies it ranges from 1994 to 2015. So, there has been almost no need for recent purchases by teachers to update their curricula in the last 10 years.</p> <p>Students and faculty, including those with disabilities, have access to all resources.</p> <p>UTMS has the necessary infrastructure to support online education, making it suitable for distance learning.</p>
<p>The work of the support/administrative services is appropriately organized and serves the function of internal quality assurance. In their work, the services take into account flexible ways of learning and teaching as well as the needs of the different student population (for example, students older than 25 years, part-time and employed students, students from abroad and students with special needs). The number of employees in the support/administrative services and their profile is appropriate</p>	X			<p>UTMS administrative services - including the Student Office, Legal Office, IT Office and Finance Office - are available to students daily from 08:30 to 16:30. Additionally, on the third Sunday of each month, these offices extend their working hours until 21:00 to better accommodate students' schedules. During these extended working hours, Student Services staff are available to assist with all administrative questions related to the study process and to promptly respond to student requests submitted via email</p>

for the number of students in all types of studies. Support and administrative staff have the opportunity to develop their own competencies.			
The institution encourages the involvement of students in scientific research projects in all cycles of studies.		X	Students participated in two Erasmus+ projects: All Roads Lead to Rome and Impact Academy – 10 students in total. Students are also involved in master thesis research seminars. Involving external partners could result in more applied and professional projects and challenges for students. There was no clear evidence that first-cycle students are systematically involved or encouraged to participate in research activities. Expanding research engagement of undergraduate students would strengthen the learning environment and support the development of academic skills expected in international higher education practice.
Students have at their disposal specific forms of support including: an academic development advisor who monitors their development, provides support for career planning and other academic challenges and/or a functional Career Center, mentoring sessions, psychological support, etc.	X		The Career Center organizes annual meetings with alumni to maintain ongoing engagement and monitor their professional development and career progress. These meetings also serve to support alumni in their professional progress by providing networking opportunities, sharing relevant job openings, and offering information on project calls and employment opportunities. If necessary, psychological support is also available.
The institution has a functional system for monitoring the members of the Alumni community. The Alumni community is included in the development plans of the institution. The institution organizes regular events and/or initiatives through which contact with graduated students is maintained	X		Within this system, regular updates are maintained on alumni achievements, career advancement, and involvement in academic or professional fields. The Career Center of the University of Skopje maintains a comprehensive database of each generation of graduates, tracking their career paths in cooperation with the UTMS Alumni Club. The institution ensures that this information is regularly updated to reflect the ongoing professional development of alumni.
Students actively participate in the management of the institution. A student assembly and a student ombudsman or his deputy operate within the institution. The institution supports the social, cultural and sports activities of students. It provides them with premises, support, and an annual budget.	X		Active student involvement is observed in the Student Assembly of the University and the Faculty, the Student Ombudsman, the UTMS Alumni Club, and through support for social, cultural, and sports activities. organize student parties, cocktails after occasion graduation and ceremonies. There is no independent budget for student activities, although a certain percentage is provided, but students must seek approval for each proposal.
Students are familiar with the services and opportunities available to them.	X		In interviews, students showed a high level of satisfaction with the services and had no complaints.
FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard. The study program MEETS the above Standard (all study programs are assessed).			

STANDARD 7: INFORMATION MANAGEMENT

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLY FULFILL	EXPLANATION
The higher education institution regularly collects, analyses and uses information	X			The institution has established a systematic process for collecting and analyzing data related to the implementation

<p>that is important for the successful implementation of study programmes and other activities. Through an efficient process of collecting and analysing data on study programmes and other activities, the data is entered into the internal quality assurance system.</p>			<p>and quality of its study programs. This process includes end-of-semester student surveys, regular analyses of academic performance, and feedback from faculty and administrative staff. The findings are discussed at academic council meetings and directly influence curriculum development and resource planning. In addition, UTMS uses a comprehensive digital system for collecting information through questionnaires, alumni surveys, employer feedback, and internal monitoring mechanisms, ensuring a continuous evidence-based approach to quality improvement.</p>
<p>The information collected is relevant to the profile of the institution or study programmes and includes: key performance indicators; the profile of the student population; student progress, success and dropout rates; the degree to which students meet the expectations of the study programmes; the learning resources and support available to students, data on the employment of graduates and their careers, etc. Students and staff are involved in the processes of providing and analysing data as well as in the planning of activities arising from them.</p>		X	<p>Feedback from students and employers directly contributed to the redesign of modules in hospitality technology and wine tourism, as well as the introduction of additional internships. These changes are not recorded in documents, but are only presented orally in interviews. Formal minutes of various communications with stakeholders would be appropriate, in terms of monitoring changes.</p>
<p>The institution keeps a register of significant events, activities and processes. The data is collected, analysed and used to meet the needs of the strategic management of the institution.</p>		X	<p>The Dean's Annual Report (Annual Report of the Faculty of Tourism) provides a comprehensive overview of the Faculty's activities and overall performance during the year. In addition, the minutes of the Advisory Board meetings provide valuable insight into key recommendations, strategic discussions and stakeholder engagement that supports continuous improvement and development. This area could be strengthened through more systematic use of data to inform planning and continuous improvement.</p>
<p>The security of information (in printed and electronic form) especially information related to student data, exam results, discussion on digital platforms, etc. is protected. The institution adequately protects the personal data of all stakeholders.</p>		X	<p>The E-STUDENT platform is a secure, digital academic records management system, accessible only to authorized users through individual login credentials and role-based access rights. Upon enrollment, each student receives unique credentials that allow secure access to their grades, course materials, class schedules, and personal academic records. The system is protected through regular audit logs, data backup protocols, and encryption measures to prevent unauthorized access or data loss. All paper records are stored securely in restricted-access archives, while digital records are routinely backed up and maintained on secure servers. The faculty ensures full compliance with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and national data protection laws.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 8: PUBLIC INFORMATION			
INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	EXPLANATION
		DOES NOT FULLY FULFILL	

<p>The higher education institution regularly publishes data on its activities and study programmes. The information published on the website and other media (print, social media) of the institution is accurate, clear, precise, objective, up-to-date and easily accessible. The institution regularly participates in or organizes fairs at which it presents its activities and study programmes. Information relating to the activities of higher education institutions is useful for potential and current students, as well as for former students, other persons and the public.</p>	X		<p>The university website provides access to legal acts, study programs, tuition fees, strategic plans and public calls, and is regularly updated in Macedonian and English. The university's social media channels (Facebook, Instagram and YouTube) are actively managed on a daily basis, encouraging dynamic engagement with students, partners and the general public. UTMS publishes the University Journal of Tourism and Management, which contains articles from faculty and students, event highlights and institutional news. In addition, UTMS actively promotes higher education through participation in national education fairs and the organization of the annual "Student Caravan", a public information initiative that visits multiple municipalities each year to engage with high school students through presentations, workshops and interactive Q&A sessions.</p>
<p>The higher education institution has published data on its activities, including information on the study programmes it implements, the admission criteria, the intended learning objectives, the qualifications that the student acquires as a result of the learning, the procedures applied in teaching, learning and assessment, the pass rates and the learning conditions available to students, information on the potential employment of graduates as well as the documents provided for in Article 21 paragraph 3 of the Law on Higher Education.</p>	X		<p>UTMS clearly them announces their own procedures for admission and conditions for entrance through website and documents what they can yes everything take over . The results from learning everything clearly defined and are placed goals based on competencies . use methods on teaching focused on The students . leads internal records for success on The students . follow career development on their former students .</p> <p>In consent with Article 21, paragraph 3, UTMS provides public availability on everyone legally prescribed documents , including : the Statute on the university and its changes , decisions for accreditation and operation , Organizational acts and the acts for systematization , the Rulebook for work on academic Tips , Final decisions for choice on academic Staff , Financial reports (publish) annually), Accepted topics for master's degree papers and the Ethical codex .</p>
<p>Key learning outcomes and research work are published on the institution's website. For example, before the defense of the doctoral dissertation, it is mandatory to publish it on the website of the higher education institution where the third cycle of studies is conducted (if applicable).</p>	X		<p>UTMS makes its research results publicly available through utmsjoe.mk and the university's official website. The institution is committed to ensuring transparency of learning outcomes and research activities for the academic community, industry stakeholders, policymakers, and the general public.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

STANDARD 9: INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND ININTERNATIONALIZATION

INDICATOR	COMPLETELY FULFILLS	PARTIALLY FULFILLS	DOES NOT FULLFILL	EXPLANATION
Students actively use student mobility opportunities. Mobility is appropriately valued and recognized.	X			9 students from the first cycle of studies who were nominated were admitted to a foreign partner in the period 2020-2025.

<p>The institution has developed a policy for international cooperation and internationalization. It has established Indicators for fulfilling the priorities of international cooperation and internationalization. These Indicators are regularly monitored. A special body responsible for international cooperation and internationalization within the institution has been designated.</p>	X	<p>In its Strategic Plan, the Faculty has clearly stated its strategic goals, key activities and performance indicators in the area of international cooperation and internationalization. These include: Strengthening institutional capacities for international cooperation; Active participation in international projects and mobility programs; and Preparing the basis for international accreditation. The implementation of these activities and progress towards achieving the strategic goals are monitored annually through the preparation of the Erasmus+ Annual Report.</p>
<p>The institution has appropriate financial resources at its disposal for the implementation of international cooperation. For the needs of international cooperation, the institution allocates financial resources from its own revenues, but also uses funds from the national budget, foreign donors and programs, local government, etc.</p>	X	<p>The financing of international cooperation is mainly implemented using the Erasmus + fund and the faculty's own funds (up to 1,200 euros per member). In the period 2020-2025, funds in the amount of 160,081 euros were allocated to finance international cooperation and mobility of students and staff.</p>
<p>The institution cooperates with other institutions in the country and abroad in order to implement study programs. It implements joint projects with foreign universities (conferences, mobility and other collaborations), and the results of those projects are relevant to the study programs. The institution implements joint programs with foreign universities.</p>	X	<p>The Faculty has concluded numerous agreements and memorandums of understanding for cooperation with universities and academic centers around the world. It continuously works to provide opportunities for both staff and students to actively engage in international activities, mobility programs and academic networking. The Faculty of Economics is constantly expanding its Erasmus+ network by signing new Erasmus+ partnership agreements, strengthening its global academic presence. Namely, UTMS is the only higher education institution in North Macedonia that is a member of UNWTO - the United Nations World Tourism Organization.</p>
<p>The institution has established a system for attracting teachers and students from abroad. Foreign professors are regularly involved in teaching, are engaged as mentors or members of committees for evaluating master's and doctoral theses, etc. The number of foreign students is increasing.</p>	X	<p>In the past five years, from 2020 to 2025, as part of incoming mobility, five professors from abroad taught at the Faculty of Tourism through the Erasmus + program. Because UTMS is an integrated university, each faculty is only allocated a certain number of places; in 2025, the Faculty of Tourism received 14 places for students and 4 for professors.</p>

FINDING: The higher education institution MEETS the above Standard.

SWOT Analysis of the institution

STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Excellent physical conditions in the university-owned building. - Loyal employees and satisfied students. - Good promotional materials. - A network of regional partners has been established. - Stable financial situation. - Activities with students and industry partners at fairs, events, excursions. - Strong institutional commitment to quality improvement and compliance. - Competent teaching staff with appropriate academic qualifications. - Clear systems for academic integrity and prevention of plagiarism. - Appropriate technical resources that support learning and teaching. - Active participation in mobility through Erasmus Plus. - Transparent recruitment processes and balanced workload. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Insufficiently developed scientific productivity of the institution. - Dispersion of human resources across multiple faculties and institutes at the university, with similar study programs. - There is no formal survey of graduates and employers to collect their feedback. - There is a lack of feedback on quality assurance results to students, graduates and external stakeholders. - Self-evaluation reports do not include data on student progress, detailing retention rates, withdrawals (if any), and degree classifications.. - Insufficient criteria for evaluating research performance and low number of publications. - Key statistical indicators normally expected in a robust quality assurance framework, such as graduate destination, retention and advancement rates, degree classifications, and student-faculty ratios, were not provided. - The internship process is not structured, with no individual development plans or reports from employers. - Peer reviews have not been conducted.
OPPORTUNITIES	THREATS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Take advantage of the image of the only private university for tourism in North Macedonia. - Opportunity to attract students from new markets. - Make better use of the alumni club and its members (also internationally). - The Mindshop could be upgraded into an innovation lab where students could be trained in idea development and entrepreneurial ventures. - Potential for establishing joint projects and future joint programs with foreign universities. - Opportunity to attract international students through clearer strategies and promotion. - Development of structured frameworks for practical work that define learning outcomes and track student progress. - Stronger engagement with employers, including guest speakers, project collaboration, and feedback panels. - Broader staff development in pedagogy, innovation and technologically enhanced learning. - Improved systems for monitoring research activity using clear evaluation indicators. - Development of microcredits that can attract new students, support lifelong learning, and diversify program offerings. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Declining demographic and economic trends in the country. - Failure to secure diverse sources of funding. - Risk that programs may become outdated without systematic data-driven review cycles. - Limited pedagogical innovation can reduce student engagement and satisfaction. - Continued low research productivity can affect academic reputation. - Stronger international competitors can attract students and staff more effectively. - Poor monitoring of practices can impact student experience and external perceptions

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations for improvement of the institution

- It is recommended that the Faculty of Tourism further develops and formalizes its stakeholder engagement and peer review processes to ensure that they are applied consistently, systematically recorded, and demonstrably contribute to continuous improvement of learning, teaching, and the student experience.
 - The Faculty of Tourism needs to strengthen its student and stakeholder engagement processes to ensure that these groups are meaningfully involved in quality assurance and improvement activities.
 - Meetings involving students, employers, and other stakeholders should be formally recorded.
 - The Faculty of Tourism should consider adopting a recognized sector practice to demonstrate how student feedback informs decision-making and programme alignment.
 - The faculty should ensure that all quality assurance documents are current, accurate and clearly aligned with the stated planning periods. The faculty should regularly update and review the documentation to provide reliable evidence of continuous improvement. The faculty should more clearly demonstrate the impact of its quality assurance processes by documenting the actions taken and showing how these actions lead to measurable improvement in programs and services.
 - The Faculty of Tourism should ensure the routine collection, analysis and provision of all essential quantitative data for monitoring academic quality. This should include, but not be limited to, the destination of graduates, retention and advancement rates, degree classifications and student-faculty ratios. The systematic use of this information should influence program improvement and contribute to the continuous improvement of the student learning experience.
 - The Faculty of Tourism needs to further develop and formalize its quality assurance processes to ensure that they function as a continuous, systematic and improvement-driven cycle, aligned with established European and international standards.
 - The Faculty of Tourism must also ensure the effective implementation of all recommendations from the current external assessment and demonstrably contribute to strengthening its quality assurance system.
 - The institution should institutionalize its program development procedures by introducing an annual review calendar that specifies timelines, responsibilities, and key milestones for all study cycles. This should be published on the university website.
 - All meetings and decisions related to the development, approval and review of the program should be formally recorded and communicated to relevant stakeholders to ensure transparency and accountability.
 - The Advisory Board should take a more proactive leadership role in overseeing these processes, ensuring consistency, systematic application, and alignment with sector expectations.
 - The Faculty of Tourism should ensure that critical thinking is explicitly embedded and consistently articulated in the learning outcomes of programs and modules at the first cycle level, addressing any discrepancies in translation or documentation.
 - The Faculty of Tourism needs to more clearly articulate how soft skills are developed, supported and assessed across both study cycles, ensuring alignment with program objectives and sector expectations.
 - Assessment strategies need to be improved to include a wider range of higher-order cognitive skills (analysis, evaluation, synthesis), with more explicit use of higher-order verbs from Bloom's Taxonomy to support deeper learning and the achievement of intended learning outcomes.
 - The Faculty of Tourism should develop a structured framework for internships, including clear learning outcomes, individual development plans agreed with students, and transparent expectations for all parties.
 - The faculty should introduce formal mechanisms such as evaluation reports from employers to document and assess student outcomes during internships and inform ongoing program improvement.
 - Strengthening partnerships with the business community by expanding engagement opportunities, including more guest speakers, virtual internships, collaborative projects, and employer participation in formative feedback panels.
 - Introducing a systematic mechanism for documenting, monitoring and evaluating skill development before and after internships, using clear indicators to measure student progress.
 - Expand the use of innovative student-centered teaching methods, including flipped learning, posters, and other active learning approaches commonly used in leading higher education institutions.
 - Promote the integration of interactive digital tools such as Mentimeter, Kahoot, and Padlet to support engagement, formative assessment, and modern learning practices.
 - Provide staff development opportunities to ensure teaching teams are familiar with and confident in applying international pedagogical practices and digital tools.
 - Key statistical reports should be made available to relevant committees and stakeholders to support transparency and evidence-based decision-making.
 - Diversify the assessment procedure to include methods that promote active learning and soft skills development and other forms of authentic assessment.
 - Expand the range of pedagogical methods used across programs to ensure teaching is inclusive, flexible, and responsive to the diverse needs of students.
-

- Regularly evaluate teaching practices to ensure they remain aligned with sector expectations for flexible and inclusive learning.
- Develop and implement a systematic process to regularly review and update teaching methods to ensure they remain current, effective and aligned with international best practices, student-centered approaches to teaching, such as active learning strategies and technology-enhanced learning tools.
- Incorporating interdisciplinary teaching and contextualized case studies throughout the modules to strengthen applied learning and relevance to the tourism sector.
- Incorporate project-based learning to enhance real-world application, problem-solving, and the development of students' core competencies.
- The faculty should encourage and support staff to increase both the quality and quantity of research publications.
- Developing a comprehensive and structured system for funding scientific and research activities to ensure sustainable support for staff research, scholarly engagement, and research-based teaching.
- Establishing transparent criteria and procedures for allocating research funds and monitoring the efficiency of resource allocation.
- Provide opportunities and incentives for staff and students to engage in research activities, ensuring alignment with strategic priorities and international expectations in the research activity, in all cycles of study.
- The faculty should establish a structured approach to the professional development of support and administrative staff, based on identified needs and the results of the annual evaluation.
- Faculty should introduce structured activities that allow first-cycle students to participate in supervised research experiences, such as small research assignments, participation in project components, or inquiry-based learning activities.
- The faculty could strengthen the role of the Advisory Board in documenting meetings and recording follow-up activities.
- The faculty could ensure that the results of the SWOT analysis are followed up with clear actions, with evidence of impact and continuous improvement.
- The faculty could incorporate these practices into its quality assurance cycle to ensure that decisions are based on data and results are regularly reviewed.
- The Faculty should ensure that all public information published on its website is available at least in English. This will improve accessibility for an international audience and support efforts to attract students from abroad, while also strengthening the international profile and visibility of the Faculty.
- The faculty should explore opportunities for developing joint programs or structured joint activities that contribute to enriching the curriculum and deepening international cooperation.
- The faculty could develop a clearer strategy for attracting international students and promoting its programs abroad.
- If the language of instruction is English, a clear policy on the required level of English language proficiency should be adopted. For example, the policy could specify an IELTS score of 5.5 for first-cycle students and 6.5 for second-cycle students.
- The faculty should explore ways to include foreign professors in mentoring and thesis evaluation processes, where appropriate.
- The Faculty of Tourism should introduce regular opportunities for pedagogical and academic development to complement existing support for scientific research.
- The institution should strengthen and clarify the indicators that guide the evaluation of scientific research work.
- Developing an international network of partners, ready to cooperate with scientific research projects, not only with exchange and mobility projects such as Erasmus+.
- Motivating and stimulating academic staff to publish in ranked journals (Scopus, WoS)
- The Faculty should invite more guests from the tourism sector to provide examples, case studies, and real-life challenges to students, directly during lectures.
- More active and formal involvement of people from the tourism sector in course and study program reviews, to update content and monitor trends.
- Regular updating of curricula with current mandatory literature, no older than five years.
- Prepare a long-term strategy that will reflect the actual state and position of Tourism studies at the University, with a vision for further development (postgraduate studies or college).
- Consider including all study programs in the field of tourism at the Faculty, instead of dispersing them within other organizational members of the university (institutes, faculties).
- Students should be better and formally informed about the results of surveys, their suggestions for improvements, the findings of self-evaluation reports, etc. Publishing reports on the website is not enough.
- Graduates and external stakeholders (internship mentors, employers, etc.) should be formally informed of the findings of the self-evaluation reports.
- Providing market research for tourism needs and preparing a portfolio of short workshops with specific content that may be missing (market research, entering new markets, designing logos or promotional materials, human resource management, etc.).

PROPOSAL

Based on the evaluation conducted, we propose EXTENSION of the accreditation of the higher education institution. In addition, we propose EXTENSION of the accreditation of the following study programs::

- TOURISM – first-cycle four-year studies (240 ECTS)
- TOURISM – second-cycle one-year studies (60 ECTS)

Voted in favor of this proposal: Akad.Vlado Kambovski, dr. Armand Faganel, dr Wilfrid Flanda

Voted against this proposal:

SEPARATE OPINION